

MUCKAMORE ABBEY HOSPITAL INQUIRY
SITTING AT CORN EXCHANGE, CATHEDRAL QUARTER, BELFAST

HEARD BEFORE THE INQUIRY PANEL
ON THURSDAY, 9TH JUNE 2022 - DAY 4

Gwen Malone Stenography
Services certify the
following to be a
verbatim transcript of
their stenographic notes
in the above-named
action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY
SERVICES

4

APPEARANCES

CHAIRPERSON: MR. TOM KARK QC

INQUIRY PANEL: MR. TOM KARK QC - CHAIRPERSON
PROF. GLYNIS MURPHY
DR. ELAINE MAXWELL

COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY: MR. SEAN DORAN QC
MS. DENISE KILEY BL
MR. MARK McEVROY BL
MS. SHIRLEY TANG BL
MS. SOPHIE BRIGGS BL
MR. JAMES TOAL BL

INSTRUCTED BY: MS. LORRAINE KEOWN
SOLICITOR TO THE INQUIRY

SECRETARY TO THE INQUIRY: MS. JACLYN RICHARDSON

ASSISTED BY: MR. STEVEN MONTGOMERY
MS. KAREN MCGUIGAN
MS. FINOLA FRIEL

FOR ACTION FOR MUCKAMORE &
SOCIETY OF PARENTS AND
FRIENDS OF MUCKAMORE: MS. MONYE ANYADIKE-DANES QC
MS. HELENA WILSON
MR. STEPHEN McQUITTY

INSTRUCTED BY: PHOENIX LAW SOLICITORS

FOR GROUP 3: MR. CONOR MAGUIRE QC
MS. VICTORIA ROSS

INSTRUCTED BY: O'REILLY STEWART SOLICITORS

FOR BELFAST HEALTH &
SOCIAL CARE TRUST: MR. JOSEPH AIKEN QC
MS. ANNA McLARNON BL
MR. MATTHEW YARDLEY BL
MS. LAURA KING BL

INSTRUCTED BY: DIRECTORATE OF LEGAL SERVICES

FOR DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH:

MR. ANDREW MCGUINNESS BL
MS. EMMA TREMLETT BL
MRS. SARA ERWIN BL

INSTRUCTED BY:

DEPARTMENTAL SOLICITORS
OFFICE

FOR RQIA:

MR. MICHAEL NEESON BL
MR. DANIEL LYTTLE BL

INSTRUCTED BY:

DIRECTORATE OF LEGAL SERVICES

FOR PSNI :

MR. MARK ROBINSON QC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. COLIN HANNA
DCI JILL DUFFIE

COPYRIGHT: Transcripts are the work of Gwen Malone Stenography Services and they must not be photocopied or reproduced in any manner or supplied or loaned by an appellant to a respondent or to any other party without written permission of Gwen Malone Stenography Services

I N D E X

	PAGE
SUBMISSION BY MR. AIKEN:	6
SUBMISSION BY MR. NEESON:	30
STATEMENT FROM THE CHAIRMAN	41
SUBMISSION BY MR. MAGUIRE:	45

1 THE INQUIRY RESUMED ON THURSDAY, 9TH JUNE 2022

2 AS FOLLOWS:

3
4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

5 MR. DORAN: Good morning. 10:30

6 CHAIRMAN: Good morning.

7 MR. DORAN: Chair, the Inquiry will hear three opening
8 statements today. First, Joseph Aiken QC, will speak
9 on behalf of the Belfast Health and Social Care Trust.

10 Following a short break, Michael Neeson will then make 10:31
11 the opening statement on behalf of The Regulation
12 Quality Improvement Authority. And after Mr. Neeson's
13 statement we will have another short break and Conor
14 Maguire QC, will then speak on behalf of the individual
15 Core Participants, represented by O'Reilly Stewart. 10:31

16 CHAIRMAN: Excellent.

17 MR. DORAN: I think the original plan was to run into
18 the afternoon, Chair, but I've spoken to all three
19 representatives and we're all confident that the three
20 statements can be accommodated in the morning session. 10:31

21 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Well that's fine if they can that's
22 all well and good, but obviously I don't want anybody
23 to rush, but if we can do that then that will free up
24 the afternoon for other work. So we'll see. Okay.

25 MR. DORAN: Absolutely. Just one short matter to bring 10:32
26 to the attention of the Panel. Mr. McGuinness, who
27 gave the opening statement yesterday for the Department
28 of Health, has asked me to mention this matter. When
29 giving his opening on behalf of the Department he

1 referred to the Health and Social Care Act Northern
2 Ireland. He referred to the year of the Act as 2002,
3 and he's asked me to remind the Panel that the correct
4 year is of course 2022, and that was in fact the Act
5 that led to the dissolution of the Board.

10:32

6 CHAIRMAN: Yes, that was picked up by the Panel in
7 fact, but thank you very much.

8 MR. DORAN: Yes, indeed.

9 CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you. Yes, Mr. Aiken.
10 Thank you.

10:32

11
12 SUBMISSION BY MR. AIKEN:

13
14 MR. AIKEN: Sir, members of the Panel. First an
15 apology, I'm afraid the head cold, not Covid, has not
16 entirely cleared and therefore the voice is more croaky
17 than it would normally be. I think the official
18 medical diagnosis is "man flu" in this jurisdiction,
19 but I'll soldier on and anything that's not clear no
20 doubt you'll indicate and I'll repeat it, but I would
21 be grateful if you bear with me.

10:32

10:33

22
23 Chairman, members of the Panel, and as you, sir, have
24 already indicated, as has Mr. Doran, I am Joseph
25 Aiken QC. In respect of this Public inquiry I am the
26 senior counsel instructed on behalf of the Belfast
27 Health and Social Care Trust, which I will, from now
28 on, refer to before the Inquiry as the Belfast Trust.
29

10:33

1 I lead Ms. Anna McLarnon who is present with me,
2 Ms. Laura King and Mr. Matthew Yardley, all of the Bar
3 of Northern Ireland. We are instructed by solicitors
4 within the Directorate of Legal Services, which
5 provides legal services to health and social care 10:34
6 bodies in Northern Ireland. Those solicitors are
7 Ms. Aideen Ward, Mr. John Johnson and Ms. Jane McManus.
8 Ms. McManus is here this morning.

9
10 Also, in attendance today, members of the Panel, during 10:34
11 the making of this opening statement on behalf of the
12 Belfast Trust, is the Chairman of the Belfast Trust,
13 Mr. Peter McNaney, and the Chief Executive of the
14 Belfast Trust, Dr. Cathy Jack. Their presence should
15 be understood to indicate, amongst others, two 10:34
16 important matters. First, recognition that the Belfast
17 Trust failed in its core duty to look after the safety
18 of its patients at Muckamore Abbey Hospital. And
19 second, a demonstration of the commitment of the
20 Belfast Trust to the work of this Inquiry, if that's 10:35
21 not already evident from the extent of the ongoing
22 collaboration over the provision of very large volumes
23 of relevant documentation to assist with the Inquiry's
24 work.

25 10:35
26 The Belfast Trust is grateful for the opportunity to
27 make a short opening statement acknowledging, as I do,
28 that the Inquiry is at a very early stage of its work.
29 The Belfast Trust recognises that the Inquiry's Terms

1 of Reference are broad and extensive. The Belfast
2 Trust appreciates that for the Inquiry to fulfil its
3 Terms of Reference, then, in addition to examining and
4 acknowledging the unacceptable abuse of patients which
5 occurred at Muckamore Abbey Hospital - a subject to 10:35
6 which I will shortly return - and trying to understand
7 why it occurred, the Inquiry will also have to examine
8 complex and difficult issues surrounding the provision
9 of learning disability care, or what's now referred to
10 within the Belfast Trust as intellectual disability 10:36
11 care. It is complex care to provide and it is provided
12 in a context that continues to be challenging.

13
14 It is not possible for me to address you in the present
15 context on the myriad of issues that are likely to 10:36
16 require detailed examination by the Inquiry. However,
17 I can assure the Inquiry, on behalf of the Belfast
18 Trust, that it is committed to engaging openly,
19 honestly and transparently in the Inquiry process. The
20 Belfast Trust has openly encouraged and will continue 10:36
21 to encourage its relevant staff to participate in the
22 Inquiry and, importantly, to say whatever it is they
23 wish to say to the Inquiry.

24
25 The Belfast Trust recognises that some of the evidence 10:37
26 the Inquiry will gather will not be edifying of the
27 Belfast Trust and its staff. It will be difficult for
28 patients, and former patients, families, and the
29 Belfast Trust and its staff to hear. However, the

1 Belfast Trust is committed to learning as much as
2 possible through the Inquiry process so as to make its
3 ongoing and future provision of learning disability
4 care both as safe and as fulfilling for patients as it
5 possibly can.

10:38

6
7 The Belfast Trust was formed in 2006 and became
8 operational in 2007. It was formed through the
9 amalgamation of six health and social services trusts
10 in Belfast, often now referred to as Legacy Health and
11 Social Services Trusts. The formation of the Belfast
12 Trust was the result of the wider review of public
13 administration in Northern Ireland that commenced in
14 2002. One of those six Legacy Trusts that merged to
15 form the Belfast Trust, and that is the North and West
16 Belfast Health and Social Services trust, had been
17 responsible for the operation of Muckamore Abbey
18 Hospital at the time of the amalgamation that created
19 the Belfast Trust in 2006. That is how Muckamore Abbey
20 Hospital came to be within the Belfast Trust when it
21 was formed.

10:38

10:38

10:39

22
23 The Belfast Trust recognises that the Inquiry's Terms
24 of Reference extend back to the time when the Legacy
25 North and West Belfast Health and Social Services trust
26 was responsible for the operation of Muckamore Abbey
27 Hospital, and the Belfast Trust will do all it can to
28 provide relevant information about matters that predate
29 2007 and about which the Inquiry considers require

10:39

1 investigation.

2
3 The Belfast Trust is, on any analysis, a vast and
4 complex organisation. It is one of the largest Health
5 Trusts in the United Kingdom, and given health and 10:39
6 social care is integrated in Northern Ireland, unlike
7 elsewhere in the United Kingdom, it is by far the
8 largest integrated Health and Social Care Trust in the
9 United Kingdom.

10
11 It delivers a wide array of treatment and care to 10:40
12 around 340,000 citizens of Belfast, as well as
13 providing the majority of regional specialist services
14 for Northern Ireland. It operates across a number of
15 hospital sites, such as the Royal Victoria Hospital, 10:40
16 the Belfast City Hospital, the Mater Hospital, Musgrave
17 Park, the Royal Jubilee Maternity Hospital, and the
18 Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children. The Belfast
19 Trust contains the major teaching and training
20 hospitals in Northern Ireland. 10:41

21
22 The Belfast Trust also provides and operates
23 facilitates at Knockbracken, which provides various
24 inpatient mental health services; Beechcroft, a child
25 and adolescent mental health unit; the Ivy Centre, an 10:41
26 inpatient facility for young people with a learning
27 disability and mental health needs; and Muckamore Abbey
28 Hospital, which, as you're aware, provides assessment
29 and treatment for people with severe learning

1 disabilities and mental health needs.

2
3 The work of the Belfast Trust is not limited to the
4 care and services it provides in hospitals. It also
5 delivers a vast range of health and social care

10:41

6 services across Belfast to support service users to

7 live within their communities. Those social care

8 services include the provision of elderly care home

9 placements, domiciliary care to over 4,000 service

10 users across Belfast, the provision and operation of

10:42

11 fourteen day centres, five residential homes, five

12 supported living facilities, together with the

13 provision and operation of eleven children's homes.

14 The children's services part of the Belfast Trust has,

15 amongst other things, responsibility for over 950

10:42

16 looked after children.

17
18 The Belfast Trust has a workforce of almost 21,500 full
19 and part-time staff. To try to put that in some

20 context: the largest private employer in Northern

10:42

21 Ireland employs less than 11,000 people. The combined

22 total staff of the entire Northern Ireland Civil

23 Service employed across all the Government departments

24 here is some 21,400 staff, approximately 500 of whom

25 are in the Department of Health.

10:43

26
27 The Belfast Trust has approximately twice as many

28 employees as each of the other regional Health Trusts

29 in Northern Ireland.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

In the intellectual disabilities division of the Belfast Trust, which is where Muckamore Abbey Hospital now sits, and which is within the mental health intellectual disability and psychological services directorate, one of eight service facing directorates that make up the service provision of the Belfast Trust, there are over 2,000 members of staff, over 1,000 of whom are involved in the provision of acute care, and over 1,000 of whom are involved in the provision of community services.

10:43

10:44

The Belfast Trust has an annual budget of approximately £1.9 billion. To try to put that in context, that is about one sixth of the entire core Dell funding provided to the Northern Ireland executive by the United Kingdom government, what would be commonly referred to as "the block grant". Almost half the block grant received into Northern Ireland from Westminster moves through the Department of Health, at present approximately £6.5 billion, just under one-third of that health funding allocation is then utilised to fund the Belfast Trust and the care it provides.

10:44

10:44

10:45

Those statistics demonstrate that the Belfast Trust is a very large health and social care organisation. It has, by necessity, a complex governance structure. The 2020 leadership and governance review - which was

1 referred to by Mr. Doran QC during his opening
2 statement on Tuesday - variously described the complex
3 governance structure and governance arrangements as
4 "comprehensive and appropriate". As the Inquiry will
5 appreciate, the provision of health and social care is 10:45
6 not without risk, and there is a detailed and complex
7 structure in place in the Belfast Trust to try to
8 manage the inevitable risk. It will not always
9 succeed. A system relies on people. It relies on
10 people to do the right thing at the right time. When 10:46
11 that does not happen then the system will fail. Trying
12 to understand what lies behind someone not doing the
13 right thing is an examination that is welcomed by the
14 Belfast Trust. It is a problem in the present context
15 that is unlikely to be confined to the staff of the 10:46
16 Belfast Trust.

17
18 However, it is also important to recognise that the
19 vast majority of care delivered by the Belfast Trust,
20 in hospitals and in the community, day in and day out, 10:46
21 including today, and some of which is extremely
22 difficult and complex care to provide, is delivered
23 safely by a highly skilled and highly dedicated staff
24 where significant risks are managed by the complex
25 governance structure that the Belfast Trust has in 10:47
26 place.

27
28 I spoke just now, Chairman, members of the Panel, of
29 the excellent care routinely provided by the staff of

1 the Belfast Trust. The abuse that occurred at
2 Muckamore Abbey Hospital, some of which has ultimately
3 led to the establishment of this Public inquiry is the
4 antithesis of care. It is a source of shame for the
5 Belfast Trust and its dedicated staff. It involved a 10:48
6 betrayal of the values of the Belfast Trust. Those
7 values are upheld day after day, year after year, by
8 the vast majority of the staff of the Belfast Trust.
9 They are adhered to by the very large numbers of staff
10 of the Belfast Trust who provide health and social care 10:48
11 and related services to hundreds of thousands of
12 patients and service users every year.

13
14 In addition to the immediate and unacceptable harm
15 caused to patients, abhorrent as that was, it has 10:48
16 further exacerbated the difficulties in operating
17 Muckamore Abbey Hospital, examples of which are set out
18 in the two reports that Mr. Doran QC referred you to on
19 Tuesday and which preceded the work of this Inquiry.

20 10:49
21 The Belfast Trust has, rightly, on a number of
22 occasions since the summer of 2017, publicly apologised
23 for the abuse that occurred at Muckamore Abbey
24 Hospital. Before I, at the first opportunity during
25 the Inquiry's public hearings, give an apology on 10:49
26 behalf of the Belfast Trust to all of the patients
27 affected by abuse at Muckamore Abbey Hospital and to
28 their families, I want to refer the Panel to some of
29 what the Belfast Trust has already said on the subject.

1
2 on 26th July 2018, following a newspaper report about
3 the growing number of staff suspensions at Muckamore
4 Abbey Hospital arising from the Belfast Trust's ongoing
5 review of CCTV footage, and due to the growing 10:50
6 realisation of the extent of what was being uncovered,
7 the Belfast Trust issued a public statement that said:

8
9 "From the outset, the Belfast Trust wishes to apologise
10 unreservedly to those patients and to their families 10:50
11 who have been affected by treatment which falls
12 significantly below acceptable professional standards
13 and which our patients have every right to expect. We
14 are in the process of meeting with the families so that
15 we can apologise to them directly and to explain in 10:50
16 further detail the actions we are taking. We wish to
17 assure all of the patients who we care for in Muckamore
18 Abbey Hospital, and their families, that their safety
19 is our absolute priority at all times. An adult
20 safeguarding investigation was initiated." 10:51

21
22 - as the quotation went on:

23
24 "...in September 2017, following reports of
25 inappropriate behaviour and the alleged physical abuse 10:51
26 of patients by staff in two wards in Muckamore Abbey
27 Hospital, one of which was the Psychiatric Intensive
28 Care Unit. At that time we took swift action and
29 suspended four members of staff. Since then, we have

1 put in place enhanced arrangements to ensure high
2 standards of care are maintained. As part of the
3 ongoing investigation and a review of archived CCTV
4 footage, a further number of past incidents have been
5 brought to our attention in the last week. Due to the 10:52
6 serious nature of this evidence we have taken immediate
7 action to suspend nine staff, the majority of whom are
8 nurses, and we are currently in the process of
9 interviewing ten further staff who were reported to us
10 as witnesses to these events. 10:52

11
12 Belfast Trust has secured the services of an expert
13 panel, which includes a carer, to independently review
14 the standard of care in Muckamore Abbey Hospital."

15
16 Chairman, members of the Panel, that was the position
17 at the time of the statement made in July 2018, and the
18 statement concluded:

19
20 "This regrettable and unacceptable situation in no way 10:52
21 reflects the work of our 500 dedicated and professional
22 staff who provide excellent care every day to the 80
23 patients in Muckamore [as it was at the time].

24 Finally, we wish to emphasise our profound sadness at
25 this situation and our commitment to ensure patients 10:53
26 are cared for safely in Muckamore Abbey Hospital."

27
28 On 24th September 2018 - so two months later - which
29 was the day that representatives of the Belfast Trust

1 met with families affected by abuse to discuss the
2 Draft Level 3 Independent Serious Adverse Incident
3 Report, which, as you know, is entitled "A review of
4 safeguarding at Muckamore Abbey Hospital - a way to
5 go", the Belfast Trust made the following public
6 apology:

10:53

7
8 "Today senior trust staff met with families to discuss
9 the findings and draft recommendations of the report
10 commissioned by Belfast Trust into a review of
11 safeguarding at Muckamore Abbey Hospital. We want to
12 place on record our sincere apologies to those patients
13 and their families affected by staff behaviours which
14 fell significantly below professional standards and
15 were unacceptable. An adult safeguarding investigation
16 was initiated in September 2017 following reports of
17 inappropriate behaviour and alleged physical abuse of
18 patients by staff in two wards in Muckamore Abbey
19 Hospital. These ongoing investigations are being
20 carried out between the PSNI and adult safeguarding
21 social workers. We have taken..."

10:53

10:54

10:54

22
23 - the statement went on:

24
25 "...decisive action, which included placing, at that
26 time, 13 members of staff on precautionary suspension.
27 We're actively working on improving leadership and
28 management arrangements at Muckamore Abbey Hospital
29 with the goal of ensuring that the voices of patients,

10:54

1 family carers, advocates and others are clearly and
2 effectively part of the future arrangements in
3 Muckamore Abbey Hospital. A director oversight group
4 led by the director of nursing and the director of then
5 the adult social and primary care directorate is in 10:55
6 place."

7
8 The statement went on:

9
10 "Everyone has the right to be safe and free from harm. 10:55
11 Safeguarding means having measures in place to protect
12 human rights, health and wellbeing, particularly for
13 vulnerable people. In recognition of this, the Trust
14 separately commissioned a fully independent team to
15 undertake a review of the broader factors in Muckamore 10:55
16 Abbey Hospital to provide a clear picture as to what
17 happened, and to make recommendations on how to improve
18 safeguarding.

19
20 The review team brought a wide range of experience, 10:56
21 perspectives and expertise as advocates, practitioners
22 clinicians, researchers and managers in service
23 provision for people with learning disabilities and
24 autism. The findings of the review team highlighted
25 that improvements are required in leadership and 10:56
26 management, adult safeguarding approaches, advocacy,
27 access to meaningful activities for patients and
28 physical healthcare. We fully accept all the findings
29 and will now work to ensure these are delivered."

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

The statement went on that:

"The report strongly urges the Trust and the wider health and social care and housing organisations to redouble their efforts to ensure that patients do not have to live in hospital environments. It recommends patients are enabled to live full lives in the community with access to the right specialist multidisciplinary support in the right accommodation. The key recommendations were. . . "

10:57
10:57

- and I quote:

"No one should have to live their lives out in hospital. The report recommends a renewed commitment to enabling people with learning disabilities and autism to have full lives in their communities.

10:57

Secondly, to delivery robust multidisciplinary community services which recognise the full range of needs of people and families throughout their lives; and, thirdly, that assessment and treatment units closer to home and effective long-term quality accommodation options are provided. "

10:57
10:58

The Belfast Trust went on to say:

"We are committed to ensuring patients are cared for

1 safely in Muckamore Abbey Hospital and we recognise and
2 pay tribute to the many highly skilled and dedicated
3 staff who remain working in Muckamore Abbey Hospital."

4
5 The statement concluded:

10:58

6
7 "We wish to emphasise our commitment to openness and
8 transparency to families and others in relation to
9 sharing information appropriately. We are truly sorry
10 that we have let our patients and their families down.
11 Our priority now, and in the future, is to engage with
12 the patients, families, staff, the Department of Health
13 and the Health and Social Care Board (as it was at the
14 time) to deliver a future model of care for learning
15 disability and autism."

10:58

10:59

16
17 Having received the final version of the safeguarding
18 report, "A review of adult safeguarding at Muckamore
19 Abbey Hospital - a way to go", the Belfast Trust met
20 with the families of patients in order to share and
21 discuss the content of the report with them. Having
22 done so, the Belfast Trust publicly acknowledged on
23 11th December 2018, and I quote:

10:59

24
25 "Following receipt of the final report of the expert
26 independent team reviewing safeguarding at Muckamore
27 Abbey Hospital, the service director of the Trust,
28 alongside the independent Chair of the review team have
29 this week met individually with the families of those

10:59

1 affected to share and discuss the report with them.
2 The Trust has previously met with families in late
3 September to discuss the findings and recommendations
4 of the draft version of the report. At each meeting
5 with the families this week Belfast Trust, again, 11:00
6 wholly and unreservedly apologised for the unacceptable
7 behaviour of some members of staff, which is a matter
8 of profound regret.

9
10 On 15th February 2019, when the Belfast Trust published 11:00
11 a summary of the SAI report..."

12
13 The "a way to go" report.

14
15 "... the Belfast Trust said publicly that it: 11:00

16
17 "Reiterates its unreserved apology to those families
18 who have been affected by staff behaviours which fell
19 significantly below professional standards and our
20 profound regret in letting parents and family carers 11:01
21 down. The Trust gives its full assurance that it
22 welcomes ongoing scrutiny and is committed to ensuring
23 that patients are cared for safely in the Hospital,
24 that a positive way forward is provided for patients
25 and families and that the recommendations in the review 11:01
26 are realised."

27
28 Shortly thereafter, on the evening of 18th February
29 2019, the Chair of the Board of the Belfast Trust,

1 Peter McNaney, and the then Chief Executive of the
2 Belfast Trust, Martin Dillon, met with families to
3 restate in person the Belfast Trust's previous
4 apologies for the unacceptable behaviours of staff in
5 Muckamore Abbey Hospital and to discuss the proposals 11:01
6 to respond to the recommendations of the "a way to go"
7 Serious Adverse Incident Report.

8
9 The present Chief Executive of the Belfast Trust,
10 Dr. Jack, took up her role in 2020. On 5th August 11:02
11 2020, following the publication of the leadership and
12 governance report commissioned by the PHA and HSCB, as
13 it was then, at the request of the Department of
14 Health, that's the Bingham, Devlin and Reynolds report
15 entitled "A review of leadership and governance at 11:02
16 Muckamore Abbey Hospital", Dr. Jack made a video
17 statement on behalf of the Belfast Trust in response.
18 Dr. Jack said, and I quote:

19
20 "I want to put on the record my deep sense of shame and 11:02
21 profound regret that this happened within the Belfast
22 Trust. Some of the most vulnerable who were entrusted
23 to our care were maltreated and harmed, and for that I
24 am truly sorry. We failed these patients and their
25 families and we betrayed their trust. Today..." 11:03
26

27 - said Dr. Jack:

28
29 "...I pledge my commitment and that of my senior team

1 that we will tirelessly work to ensure that Muckamore
2 Abbey Hospital is a safe place for our patients. We
3 need to rebuild trust and confidence, and I do not
4 underestimate this challenge, and this will be
5 difficult given the scale of hurt we have caused." 11:03

6
7 Dr. Jack went on to say:

8
9 "The CCTV has given a voice to our patients and tells
10 their story that they could not tell themselves. How 11:03
11 an organisation cares for the most vulnerable
12 determines who we are and what we stand for, and that
13 is the responsibility of everyone who works here.

14
15 Muckamore Abbey Hospital..." 11:04

16
17 - said Dr. Jack:

18
19 "...is a different place today, much safer, but still
20 not perfect. Incidents do still happen, and will 11:04
21 happen, but I am confident that with the systems and
22 checking in place, including ongoing monitoring of CCTV
23 and the new management team who are nurturing a
24 different culture, these incidents will be detected
25 promptly and not allowed to perpetuate unseen." 11:04

26
27 As well as unreservedly apologising, Dr. Jack was
28 acknowledging, as I do on behalf of the Belfast Trust
29 before the Inquiry, that the provision of high quality

1 intellectual disability care is challenging.
2 Realistically it will not be provided without further
3 incidents occurring. Physical intervention will
4 unfortunately at times be necessary. Difficult
5 situations develop that can and do mean that staff and 11:05
6 patients can experience injury, sometimes serious
7 injury. It can be a very difficult work environment
8 for staff. No system, no matter how well developed and
9 implemented, will always prevent incident or injury in
10 the type of dynamic and difficult situations that can 11:06
11 arise and are an unfortunate part of caring for
12 patients with highly complex needs and behaviours.
13 However, that is entirely different from staff abusing
14 highly vulnerable patients. That cannot and never will
15 be acceptable in the Belfast Trust. That abuse was not 11:06
16 and is not acceptable, is demonstrated by the response
17 of the Belfast Trust.

18
19 By 24th May 2022 - so this year - arising from CCTV
20 viewing by a dedicated adult safeguarding team, some 83 11:07
21 members of staff had been placed on precautionary
22 suspension and a further 68 members of staff have been
23 placed on a form of supervision and training. On any
24 level, those are remarkable and disturbing statistics.
25 No doubt the response was not perfect, responses to 11:07
26 crises rarely are, but nonetheless extensive steps have
27 been taken to deal with the quite exceptional situation
28 that developed following the viewing of CCTV from
29 Muckamore Abbey Hospital relating to a period of months

1 in 2017. The consideration of how that quite
2 exceptional situation was and is being managed will
3 itself, no doubt, be a subject from which learning can
4 be derived. However, the Belfast Trust does not seek
5 to say that 2017 is the only time during the history of 11:08
6 Muckamore Abbey Hospital when staff conduct towards
7 vulnerable patients in their care unfortunately met the
8 broad definition of abuse as set out in paragraph 5 of
9 the Terms of Reference of this Inquiry, and was
10 consequently unacceptable. 11:09

11
12 That is why the apology I now give on behalf of the
13 Belfast Trust is to all patients affected by abuse by
14 staff at Muckamore Abbey Hospital at whatever point in
15 time that abuse occurred. 11:09

16
17 Today, Chairman, members of the Panel, before the
18 Inquiry, on behalf of the Board of the Belfast Trust,
19 and the Chief Executive and her senior executive team,
20 I, on behalf of the Belfast Trust, give an unreserved 11:09
21 and unequivocal apology to all those patients, and
22 their families, who suffered abuse at Muckamore Abbey
23 Hospital.

24
25 whilst there will, of course, have to be a detailed 11:10
26 examination of procedures and systems, scrutiny of the
27 adequacy of various responses to incidents that
28 occurred over the time period being investigated, and a
29 potentially very important discussion as to the correct

1 answer or answers to the "why" question posed by
2 Mr. Doran QC, it must continue to be heard loud and
3 clear that this formal apology to all those patients
4 and their families who suffered abuse at Muckamore
5 Abbey Hospital stands regardless. 11:10

6
7 The Belfast Trust is ashamed that some of its staff
8 employed in caring professions were involved in the
9 abuse of individuals living in Muckamore Abbey
10 Hospital, individuals who were, and are, amongst the 11:11
11 most vulnerable patients cared for by the Belfast
12 Trust. The Belfast Trust is profoundly sorry that
13 occurred. Abusive behaviour has no place in the
14 Belfast Trust. It is against the values of the Belfast
15 Trust and every professional Code of Conduct that 11:11
16 applied to the staff concerned. The Belfast Trust is
17 determined to do all that it can to root it out. Only
18 by this means can families be assured that when they
19 entrust their loved ones to the care of the Belfast
20 Trust, their loved ones are as safe as they can 11:12
21 possibly be and that their loved ones are receiving the
22 highest quality care that the Belfast Trust can
23 provide.

24
25 Some other staff of the Belfast Trust allowed some of 11:12
26 the abuse that occurred and which they witnessed to go
27 unchallenged and unreported. As well as perpetrating
28 abuse, walking past abuse is not acceptable; it is
29 behaviour that is also contrary to both the values of

1 the Belfast Trust and to every professional Code of
2 Conduct that applied to the staff concerned. The
3 Belfast Trust is profoundly sorry that that occurred.

4
5 Failing to recognise unacceptable behaviour by other 11:13
6 staff, or turning a wilful blind eye to unacceptable
7 behaviour that was recognised, will render care unsafe.
8 The Belfast Trust is clear and unequivocal; that can
9 have no place in the Belfast Trust.

10 11:13
11 Further, the Belfast Trust recognises that the
12 individual failings of the staff who abused patients,
13 or of the staff who failed to report and escalate abuse
14 they witnessed, also means that the governance systems
15 operated by the Belfast Trust, however well developed 11:13
16 in principle, failed to prevent abuse, failed to detect
17 abuse when it occurred or, when detected, failed to
18 escalate the fact it had occurred. The Belfast Trust
19 apologises for those systems failures. It is a fact
20 that governance systems, however well developed in 11:14
21 principle, rely on human beings. Consequently, there
22 will be times when they do not function as designed and
23 fail as a result.

24
25 The Belfast Trust, Chairman, members of the Panel, 11:14
26 recognises that it can be of little comfort to patients
27 abused at Muckamore Abbey Hospital, and their families,
28 that significant changes have since been made at the
29 Hospital by the Belfast Trust. It will no doubt be

1 hurtful that the changes can be said to arise as a
2 result of the abuse they suffered and which has since
3 been brought to light.

4
5 It does mean that Muckamore Abbey Hospital, though 11:15
6 obviously not perfect, is a much safer place for
7 patients to live today. While work continues at the
8 Belfast Trust, and as part of a wider regional
9 programme to develop the opportunities for patients
10 with intellectual disabilities to live and be supported 11:15
11 in a community setting rather than in a hospital.

12
13 With this, I conclude: The Belfast Trust, though
14 profoundly sorry that it is necessary, welcomes a
15 detailed and fair investigation from the Inquiry in 11:16
16 respect of the matters that fall within the Inquiry's
17 detailed Terms of Reference, which are both broad in
18 scope and time.

19
20 The Belfast Trust pledges to play its part, including 11:16
21 through extensive document provision, in helping the
22 Inquiry, amongst other things, to establish the facts
23 of what occurred, what may have caused what occurred,
24 and what might be learned to improve the provision of
25 intellectual disability care in the future, both in 11:16
26 Northern Ireland and elsewhere. However, the Belfast
27 Trust will not lose sight of the fact the events that
28 led to the Inquiry should never have occurred in the
29 first place, and that they did is something about which

1 the Belfast Trust will remain genuinely sorry.

2
3 END OF SUBMISSION BY MR. AIKEN

4
5 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Aiken, thank you very much indeed. 11:17
6 Thank you for struggling through your cold. I'm
7 pleased to see, if I may say so, the attendance of
8 Mr. McNaney and Dr. Jack, which I hope reflects the
9 importance that the Trust places on the Inquiry and the
10 cooperation that we will receive, and I also welcome 11:17
11 your words encouraging your staff, the Trust staff to
12 come forward to the Inquiry either, obviously, under
13 the auspices of the Trust, or if they want to come
14 forward independently, and I would echo those words,
15 and I am grateful for them. 11:18

16
17 We will now take a short break. At some point this
18 morning I am going to read out a statement in relation
19 to the dissemination of material to the Core
20 Participants and the rules that are going to apply to 11:18
21 that, but I think we probably all need a break now. So
22 we'll take - if we take our morning break of 15 minutes
23 now, because I think the addresses that are going to
24 follow are probably going to be a bit shorter than
25 those of the Trust. Thank you very much. 11:18

26
27 THE HEARING ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED AS FOLLOWS:

28
29 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

SUBMISSION BY MR. NEESON:

MR. NEESON: Yes. Good morning, Chair, and members of the Panel. My name is Michael Neeson. I appear on behalf of the RQIA. I'm instructed by Caroline Hannon of the Directorate of Legal Services. I am assisted by Daniel Lyttle of counsel. 11:37

Might I take this opportunity to introduce to the Panel and the wider Inquiry, the Chair of the RQIA who is in attendance, Christine Collins, and Briega Donaghy, the Chief Executive Officer. 11:38

Chair, and members of the Panel, on behalf of the Regulation and Quality Improvement Authority, the RQIA, I welcome the opportunity to provide a short statement to this Inquiry. 11:38

At the outset, the RQIA wishes to acknowledge the sincere and ongoing distress experienced by the victims of abuse at Muckamore, and the devastating impact this has and continues to have upon the families. The RQIA recognises failings in the oversight of the care provided to the patients in Muckamore and apologises to the victims and their families that it did not uncover the abuse they suffered. 11:38

The RQIA deeply respects the courage and resolution of

1 all those who have campaigned for this Inquiry and
2 those who have come forward to provide important
3 evidence to it. Their commitment, dedication and
4 determination to have their voices heard will ensure
5 this Inquiry is searching and open, and trust that it 11:39
6 shall lead to lasting change.

7
8 The RQIA undertakes to engage fully and support this
9 Inquiry. This is evidenced by the recent creation of a
10 dedicated inquiry support team to ensure that all 11:39
11 relevant evidence is sourced and available. As the
12 body tasked with the oversight and provision of advice
13 to the Department on the quality and availability of
14 services, as well as encouraging improvement within the
15 health and social care sector in Northern Ireland, the 11:40
16 RQIA welcomes the Inquiry's investigation.

17
18 The authority recognises that the persistence of bad
19 practice referred to by the Chair in his opening
20 remarks, which occurred within Muckamore, indicates a 11:40
21 lack of robust and effective oversight to keep people
22 safe. Safeguarding people is at the cornerstone of the
23 RQIA. The deeply distressing events in Muckamore have
24 led to RQIA undertaking a comprehensive review of its
25 practices and procedures to identify actions and areas 11:40
26 of improvement, both within the RQIA itself and in its
27 oversight of health and social care services. It may,
28 Chair, members of the Panel, be helpful if I give a
29 brief overview of the role and functions of the RQIA.

1 I should say, much of what I'm going to say in this
2 preliminary address will be received in much greater
3 evidence in due course by the Inquiry.
4

5 The RQIA was established by the health and personal 11:41
6 Social Services Quality Improvement and Regulation
7 Northern Ireland Order 2003, for the sake of
8 convenience I shall refer to that from here in as the
9 2003 order. The RQIA is responsible for keeping the
10 Department informed about the overall state and 11:41
11 provision of services and, in particular, about their
12 availability in quality and encouraging improvement in
13 the quality of those services by conducting reviews of
14 health and social care governance arrangements against
15 overall quality standards, thematic service reviews, 11:42
16 and reviews commissioned by the Department.
17

18 The 2003 order created a new legal framework for the
19 oversight of the quality and availability of health and
20 social care services in Northern Ireland and extended 11:42
21 regulation and quality improvement to a wider range of
22 services.
23

24 In April 2005, the Regulation Improvement Authority,
25 which was subsequently renamed The Regulation Quality 11:42
26 Improvement Authority by reason of the 2009 Health and
27 Social Care Reform Act, began to function as the
28 independent regulator of health and social care
29 services in Northern Ireland. It was not, however,

1 until 2009, under the terms of the 2009 Reform Act,
2 that the RQIA took over responsibility for the
3 oversight for the care and treatment of patients with
4 mental health and learning difficulties from the Mental
5 Health Commission.

11:43

6
7 The overall remit and role of the RQIA are set out
8 within Article 4 of the 2003 Order, which specifies the
9 service providers who are subject to its oversight. It
10 imposes the general duties of keeping the Department of
11 Health informed about the provision of services and, in
12 particular, about their availability and quality and
13 encouraging improvement in those services.

11:43

14
15 The RQIA has responsibility, under Part 3 of the 2003
16 Order, to regulate a wide range of prescribed
17 establishments and agencies which are now set out
18 within Article 8 of the 2003 Order.

11:43

19
20 Chair, I pause to observe that Muckamore does not fall
21 within the list of prescribed establishments within
22 Article 8.

11:43

23
24 In Part 4, Article 35 of the Order sets out specific
25 statutory functions for the RQIA in respect of the
26 quality of the provision of health and personal social
27 services by statutory bodies. As a service provided by
28 the Belfast Health and Social Care Trust, the provision
29 of health services at Muckamore Abbey Hospital does

11:44

1 fall within Part 4.

2
3 The RQIA functions in accordance with Article 35,
4 non-exhaustively include the conducting of reviews,
5 carrying out of investigations, the making of reports 11:44
6 and the carrying out of inspections within certain
7 prescribed circumstances. Again, further detail will
8 be provided in due course about the precise nature of
9 the duties owed by the RQIA.

10
11 Part 6 of the 2003 Order sets out the powers available 11:45
12 to the RQIA to record failures, to meet the statements
13 of minimum standards set out by the Department and to
14 set out improvements. Again, the Inquiry will hear
15 evidence concerning the policy and procedures in place 11:45
16 concerning the methods of implementation of those
17 matters generally and specifically relevant to
18 Muckamore.

19
20 A primary aspect of RQIA's role is its inspections of 11:45
21 services. RQIA's inspections may either be announced
22 or unannounced and seek to examine compliance with
23 required standards in areas appropriate for that
24 service. These inspections are conducted by a team of
25 qualified and experienced staff, including nurses, 11:46
26 social workers, pharmacists and estates and finance
27 officers. RQIA published its inspection reports for
28 adult services on its website. At present there are in
29 excess of 150 RQIA inspection records pertaining to

1 Muckamore which can be accessed on the website at
2 RQIA.org.UK. The Inquiry has received those reports as
3 part of the RQIA's disclosure of documents, as well as
4 a number of reports which predate the current website
5 publications.

11:46

6
7 It is important to note that the RQIA's duties have
8 grown since its inception in 2005. As noted briefly at
9 an earlier stage in this statement, the responsibility
10 for the protection and interests of mental health and
11 learning disability services lay with the Mental Health
12 Commission. Under the 2009 Act, the functions of the
13 Mental Health Commission, as prescribed within the
14 terms of the Mental Health Northern Ireland Order 1986,
15 the 1986 Order, transferred to the RQIA with effect
16 from 1st April 2009, and from that date the Mental
17 Health Commission ceased to exist. The RQIA will
18 provide the Inquiry with detailed evidence concerning
19 the merger of those bodies and the work and cooperation
20 between the Mental Health Commission and the RQIA.

11:47

11:47

11:47

21
22 The duties and functions of the RQIA, which devolved
23 from the Mental Health Commission, and which are
24 plainly of relevance to those receiving care within
25 Muckamore, are largely provided within Part 6 of the
26 1986 Order, and include the general duty to keep under
27 review the care and treatment of patients and the
28 further duties provided for within Article 85(2) of the
29 order. These include:

11:47

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

"The duty to make enquiry where it appears to the RQIA that there may have been ill-treatment, deficiency in care or treatment, improper detention in hospital or reception into guardianship, or where the property of a patient may be exposed to loss or damage." 11:48

Further, as often as the RQIA thinks appropriate to visit and interview in private patients who are liable to be detained in hospital under the Order, to bring to the attention of a number of bodies, including the Department and the Trusts, the facts of any case in which, in the opinion of the RQIA, it is desirable for that body to exercise its function to secure the welfare of any patient. To seek to discharge those duties, the RQIA roles include inspections of a wide range of mental health and learning disability services across Northern Ireland. At a general level, during the course of those inspections, RQIA seeks to engage with service users, with relatives and carers, and seeks the views of nursing staff, health professionals, advocates and other agencies. 11:49

In common with all RQIA's inspection activity, each inspection report provides details of the findings and includes a quality improvement plan, detailing those areas of improvement and the associated timescales. The provider is required to provide details of his actions to make the necessary improvements and this 11:49

1 forms an important part of the published inspection
2 record.

3
4 The reports of abuse in Muckamore received widespread
5 coverage in 2017. In response to reports of 11:50
6 inappropriate behaviour and the abuse of patients by
7 some members of staff within Muckamore, as we have
8 heard, the Belfast Trust commissioned an independent
9 team to undertake a serious adverse impact review with
10 a view to examining safeguarding practices at the 11:50
11 Hospital between 2012 and 2017. As a result of that
12 report, received in November 2018, the RQIA undertook a
13 number of improvements in its approach to inspection
14 and assurance across mental health and learning
15 disability wards. 11:51

16
17 From late 2018, the RQIA's inspections of mental health
18 and learning disability wards within Muckamore
19 incorporated what they describe as a whole site and
20 systems approach, using a multidisciplinary team of 11:51
21 inspectors. Those teams aim to work collaboratively
22 and intensively on site over many days gathering
23 evidence from patients and staff. It is hoped this
24 improved approach is now utilised so that it will
25 continue to strengthen safeguarding and incident 11:51
26 management. The improved governance and oversight of
27 these systems will serve to improve the RQIA's ability
28 to identify issues such as those which were highlighted
29 in 2018.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

Now, by way of some history. Subsequent inspections which took place at Muckamore in 2019 led to the RQIA taking the discharge of its statutory functions to the highest level by writing to the Department of Health and highlighting the grave nature of the concerns it had in terms of significant failings in the way the service was being run and recommending that the Department impose special measures at Muckamore Hospital.

11:52

11:52

This ultimately led to the serving of three improvement notices relating to staffing, finance and safeguarding. These improvement notices resulted in evidence improvements in Muckamore during subsequent inspections and monitoring.

11:53

The learning from those matters identified within the report, and from a number of internal reviews and reassessments of policy, has undoubtedly resulted in improvements to processes, both in terms of the nature and quality of inspections and outside of those inspections. The RQIA continues to learn and can point to positive steps taken on foot of that learning.

11:53

11:53

Following the 2018 review, the RQIA has reflected upon its previous approach to intelligence gathering and monitoring in respect of mental health and learning disability services. It has undertaken a review of its

1 approach to the use of intelligence and identified and
2 implemented a number of improvements with the oversight
3 of its executive management team and of the authority.
4 I do not propose to go into detail on the specifics of
5 those improvements, that will be an important part of 11:54
6 the evidence that the Inquiry will receive in due
7 course from the RQIA.

8
9 In addition, the RQIA has undertaken significant
10 improvement work to strengthen the assurance and 11:54
11 oversight of mental health detention forms and improve
12 its oversight and scrutiny of adverse incident
13 reporting in mental health and learning disability
14 services, which has increased its involvement in
15 safeguarding oversight meetings regarding Muckamore 11:54
16 Hospital. The RQIA continues to work to strengthen the
17 input of relatives and service users during its
18 inspections.

19
20 Chair, members of the Panel, it is important to 11:54
21 recognise that the RQIA must operate within the
22 constraints of the legislative framework on which it is
23 founded. The RQIA has full confidence that those
24 individuals tasked with undertaking the inspections and
25 reviews at Muckamore carried out their duties in good 11:55
26 faith and to the best of their abilities, however
27 within the confines of policies and historic practices
28 and procedures.

29

1 As the Inquiry has heard, the Department of Health
2 commissioned leadership and governance review published
3 in 2019, and this recognised and made recommendations
4 regarding the limitation of the regulatory framework
5 within which RQIA operates, and the gap in the RQIA's 11:55
6 functions when compared to those relevant to, for
7 example, the Care Quality Commission, the CQC.

8
9 The authority welcomes the 2018 review and the
10 recommendations to strengthen the regulatory framework 11:56
11 which would enable RQIA to effectively discharge its
12 role in the safe care and protection provided to those
13 in hospitals, including Muckamore.

14
15 It is of note that the Terms of Reference provide that 11:56
16 the Inquiry shall examine the relevant primary and
17 secondary legislation, and the regulatory framework,
18 and the other matters set out within those Terms of
19 Reference, and shall consider the adequacy of these to
20 provide a framework to prevent abuse of patients with 11:56
21 mental health conditions or learning difficulties in
22 Muckamore and other settings within Northern Ireland.

23
24 The RQIA is committed to ensuring that the failings
25 which occurred in the provision of care in Muckamore 11:56
26 never happen again.

27
28 The RQIA will engage in an effective candid and open
29 manner in with the public inquiry. It recognises and

1 embraces the positive opportunity afforded to it in
2 working with a forward-looking inquiry. The RQIA
3 embraces the broader and wider review referred to by
4 counsel for the Inquiry in his opening given the extent
5 of the Terms of Reference, and an examination of the 11:57
6 roles of the main stakeholders within the broader HSE
7 system.

8
9 The RQIA wishes to maintain focus upon the objects of
10 keeping people safe and driving improvement across 11:57
11 health and social services in Northern Ireland and
12 looks forward to the assistance of this Inquiry in
13 doing so. Thank you.

14
15 END OF SUBMISSION BY MR. NEESON 11:58

16
17 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Neeson, thank you very much indeed, and
18 welcome, also, to Ms. Collins and Donaghy, again which
19 I'll take to demonstrate their public commitment to
20 assisting this Inquiry throughout its existence. 11:58

21
22 STATEMENT FROM THE CHAIRMAN

23
24 CHAIRMAN: Before we take a short break before the
25 final address, I want to turn to the statement that I 11:58
26 mentioned earlier in relation to how we propose to
27 disseminate material to Core Participants and the rules
28 that are going to apply to that dissemination via the
29 Box system.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

There are a number of competing interests which I've had to weigh up in formulating these rules. On one hand, of course, is the importance that this public inquiry is indeed public and that Core Participants have the access that they need to view the material so that they can assist the Inquiry. I also have to take account of the great sensitivity of much of the material that we will be dealing with, much of which is going to be special category information for GDPR purposes. And I also have to consider the sort of material that we may receive in the future which will include, by way of example, material from staff, and potentially even whistleblowers and others, who will reveal highly personal and sensitive information.

11:59
11:59
11:59

Let me turn to the statement. This is going to be published on the Inquiry website, so please don't feel you need to make a note as I read it out. It will be published before or at lunch, I imagine.

12:00

This statement relates to the sending of material to Core Participants by the Inquiry and the systems in place to protect the sensitivity of the material being disclosed.

12:00

Given the sensitivity of the material to be disclosed, the following requirements are being deemed necessary by the Chair to protect the information and to ensure

1 that every Core Participant can have equal access,
2 subject to any restriction order.

3
4 1. All Core Participants will be able to view the
5 material disclosed by the Inquiry subject to any
6 restriction order placed on it by the Chair; 12:01

7
8 2. The system for disclosure will be via the Box
9 document system employed by the Inquiry;

10
11 3. Prior to being provided with access to Box, every
12 Core Participant, which means in the case of Groups 1,
13 2 and 3, each individual who is a Core Participant, and
14 in relation to organisations, all those within the Core
15 Participant organisation who wish to view material must 12:01
16 sign a confidentiality undertaking. Each individual
17 Core Participant in Groups 1, 2 and 3, and within the
18 Core Participant organisations, will have a unique
19 access log-in specific to them and which is only
20 accessible using their e-mail address; 12:02

21
22 5. In relation to designated legal representatives,
23 each person requiring access must sign an undertaking.
24 The firm - that means the solicitor's firm involved -
25 will be responsible for ensuring the confidentiality 12:02
26 undertaking is fully complied with;

27
28 6. Each counsel requiring access will be asked to sign
29 a confidentiality agreement and will be provided access

1 using an e-mail log-in;

2
3 7. No individual may pass on any material received by
4 them to any person, nor publish it in any way. This
5 does not prevent individual Core Participants 12:02
6 discussing the content of the material with their
7 designated legal representatives and counsel;

8
9 8. Each user will find that every document is
10 watermarked with their individual identity; 12:03

11
12 9. Individual users who are not legal representatives
13 will have viewing rights only. They will be able to
14 view all the material disclosed but not download or
15 print it; 12:03

16
17 10. Designated legal representatives will have the
18 ability to download, and once saved separately to
19 annotate, mark and print material. Further explanation
20 and training can be given by the secretary to the 12:03
21 Inquiry;

22
23 11. Special arrangements will be made for those who
24 have signed a confidentiality agreement but do not have
25 access to an electronic system which allows them to 12:03
26 view disclosed material on Box. The Inquiry will allow
27 the designated representatives for such individuals to
28 assist them to view any relevant material
29 electronically. Alternatively, printed material may be

1 shown by the designated representatives to individual
2 clients, but the designated representative must retain
3 the material thereafter securely. The Inquiry team can
4 also assist such individuals to view material at the
5 Inquiry premises;

12:04

6
7 12. Any breach of these requirements by way of
8 deliberate unauthorised disclosure may result in the
9 person involved being reported for possible
10 prosecution, denial of access to the Box system and
11 removal of Core Participant status.

12:04

12
13 That completes that statement. We'll now take a
14 ten-minute break and look forward to the final address
15 from Mr. Maguire. Thank you.

12:05

16
17 THE INQUIRY ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED AS FOLLOWS:

18
19 SUBMISSION BY MR. MAGUIRE:

20
21 MR. MAGUIRE: Good afternoon, Chairman, Professor
22 Murphy, Dr. Maxwell. My name is Conor Maguire. I am
23 instructed as senior counsel by O'Reilly Stewart
24 Solicitors for patient-related Core Participants, some
25 of whom are already represented by the firm, and others
26 with designated Core Participant status have approached
27 O'Reilly Stewart Solicitors to represent them at this
28 Inquiry.

12:15

12:16

1 I know already Core Participants represented by
2 O'Reilly Stewart Solicitors have been joining the
3 Inquiry via the online streaming facility.
4

5 I appear with Ms. Victoria Ross, junior counsel. The 12:16
6 solicitors engaged by O'Reilly Stewart Solicitors firm
7 that will deal with the Core Participants are a senior
8 group of solicitors within the firm, and they are
9 Mr. Tom Anderson; Mr. Joe Moore; and Mr. Patrick
10 Mullarkey. 12:17

11
12 Thank you, Chair, for permitting me to make an opening
13 statement today on behalf of a significant group of
14 individuals whose contribution will be integral to this
15 Inquiry. This is an important day for them. 12:17

16
17 Chair, I note from your opening remarks, and from
18 Mr. Doran QC's opening statement, that this cohort of
19 patient-related Core Participants is referred to, for
20 ease, as Group 3. They are described as being: 12:18

21
22 "Patients and relatives of patients at Muckamore who
23 are not affiliated to the other two groups but
24 nevertheless have a close interest in the events at
25 Muckamore." 12:18

26
27 As the Inquiry progresses, it is anticipated more Core
28 Participants will come to be represented as part of
29 Group 3. The size of the group, therefore, is yet to

1 be determined, and it is noted that Core Participant
2 statements are still in the process of being taken.

3
4 Separately, Chair, it is also anticipated that
5 non-patient-related Core Participants may also be
6 represented by O'Reilly Stewart Solicitors. 12:19

7
8 In respect of the three patient-related groups, Group 1
9 consists of those Core Participants affiliated with the
10 Society of Patients and Friends of Muckamore Abbey. 12:19

11
12 Group 2 consists of those Core Participants affiliated
13 with Action for Muckamore.

14
15 Mr. Doran, in his opening, referred to these two groups 12:19
16 and the significant positive impact each has had with
17 the Society of Parents and Friends of Muckamore Abbey
18 having, for decades, aimed at assisting patients in
19 their daily lives in the Hospital, and having worked
20 tirelessly to that end. And with Action for Muckamore 12:20
21 having actively campaigned for this Inquiry, it is
22 important, Chair, to acknowledge the efforts made by
23 these two groups to bring many issues, which include
24 those that are the subject matter of this Inquiry, into
25 the public domain, and, whilst it is likely each group 12:20
26 of patient-related Core Participants will have a
27 similar set of aims and objectives, it is important to
28 say that the Core Participants in Group 3 that I
29 represent today are being represented as individuals

1 who are not aligned to or affiliated with the other
2 groups.

3
4 It is a privilege, Chair, to be representing these Core
5 Participants who, themselves, will have advocated, many 12:21
6 quietly but firmly over the years, on behalf of their
7 relatives who were patients at Muckamore and who
8 suffered abuse there.

9
10 These patients were abused or were provided with 12:22
11 substandard care within their care environment - a
12 place in which they should have felt secure. And such
13 abuse, whatever its form, took place without reasonable
14 or appropriate scrutiny being brought to bear.

15 12:22
16 The patients and their families and their carers, as
17 has been acknowledged, were let down. The patients
18 themselves, by virtue of their disabilities, were often
19 without a physical voice or the means to communicate to
20 a caring third party about the abuse they suffered or 12:23
21 were suffering.

22
23 The Panel will, in due course, hear evidence from Core
24 Participants about their relatives who were patients at
25 the Hospital. One Core Participant, whose adult 12:23
26 brother was a patient at Muckamore, will give evidence
27 to this Inquiry of how his limited voice was, in
28 essence, removed from him. The patient - a young man -
29 was assaulted and mistreated by some staff over a

1 two-year period in the mid 2010s. Actions which
2 resulted in the suspension of a number of staff. The
3 Core Participant, the sister of this patient, records
4 in her written statement as follows:

5
6 "He was not the same after the incidents. He became
7 very withdrawn and depressed. He was put on
8 anti depressants. He enjoyed vocalising when he was
9 happy but stopped vocalising at all. He would sit in
10 his bedroom looking down. He never smiled. He didn't
11 engage with others."

12:24

12:24

12
13 Chair, loving relatives and carers of these abused
14 patients, when they brought issues to the fore, often
15 did not have their voices listened to either, with
16 devastating consequences for the patients and their
17 families, and there remains anger and frustration that
18 but for CCTV footage becoming available after having
19 emerged in 2017, these matters that are the subject
20 matter of the Inquiry would not be in the public domain
21 and action would not have been taken.

12:25

12:25

22
23 Mr. Doran said in his opening, the subject of abuse is
24 at the core of this Inquiry, and the Inquiry has
25 already heard apologies about appalling abuse suffered
26 by patients at Muckamore. This Inquiry will now
27 provide that all too often missing listening ear to the
28 families as they present their harrowing stories of
29 patient and family experiences, as they give their

12:26

1 graphic accounts of abuse and mistreatment, and as they
2 recount their painful memories. Some in relation to
3 patients that are now deceased.

4
5 It is clear that this cohort of individuals, the family 12:26
6 members and carers of patients, have valuable and
7 germane evidence to give to the Inquiry. It is
8 apparent, Chair, from accounts already given and
9 recorded in statement form with the assistance of
10 Cleaver Fulton Rankin Solicitors, that the evidence of 12:27
11 those Core Participants goes to the heart of the issues
12 identified in the Terms of Reference for this Inquiry.

13
14 As Mr. Doran has indicated, further statements are
15 expected from more patient-related Core Participants 12:27
16 and for those to be represented by O'Reilly Stewart
17 Solicitors, we will ensure that they are appropriately
18 advised and guided through the Inquiry process.

19
20 Mr. Doran also referred to the assistance given to him 12:28
21 by his counsel team in collating the materials relevant
22 to the Inquiry. We are grateful to Mr. Doran for his
23 engagement with us to date, and we are also grateful,
24 Chair, to the solicitor for the Inquiry, Ms. Keogh, for
25 her invaluable assistance to date on administrative 12:28
26 matters.

27
28 It is anticipated there will be a considerable volume
29 of material generated in this Inquiry and disclosed to

1 us as it progresses and, indeed, Chair, you gave a
2 statement relevant to that just before I came to the
3 lectern.

4
5 This will be a developing process and we are at an 12:29
6 early stage. However, we do not underestimate the
7 extent of this undertaking, and consistent with our
8 obligation in representing and safeguarding the
9 interests of our Core Participant group, we offer our
10 assistance to the Inquiry. 12:29

11
12 We will ensure, Chair, that contributions made by the
13 Core Participants in Group 3 will be presented clearly
14 and concisely and we will engage in a collaborative way
15 to complement the work of the Inquiry team. 12:29

16
17 As representatives of the unaffiliated Core
18 Participants, we will ensure the voices of those most
19 acutely affected by the matters under consideration are
20 heard. Their active participation is vital to the 12:30
21 proper consideration of the issues within the Inquiry's
22 Terms of Reference. Their participation will, we say,
23 Chair, whether or not they give evidence anonymously,
24 be in the public interest, because you, Chair, said as
25 follows: 12:30

26
27 "The Inquiry is important to the wider mental health
28 and learning disability services here which need to
29 learn from its mistakes. The treatment and care of

1 those with learning disabilities or with mental health
2 illness who are, by their nature, vulnerable, should be
3 of a high quality and safe in any civilised society.
4 And without predetermining any issue, it is quite
5 obvious that bad practices were allowed to persist at 12:31
6 the Hospital to the terrible detriment of a number of
7 patients. "

8
9 Chair, our Core Participants will play an integral role
10 within the Inquiry, and in doing so, hopefully, will 12:31
11 contribute to the restoration of confidence in
12 organisations tasked with the caring for the most
13 vulnerable members of our society.

14
15 The Inquiry has already heard a lot of detail through 12:31
16 the opening statements relating to legislation,
17 regulatory frameworks, governance and management
18 structures. Our Core Participants, and indeed those
19 within Groups 1 and 2, are the relatives and carers of
20 those who were abused within Muckamore Abbey Hospital. 12:32
21 You, Chair, have already referred to the patients and
22 their relatives as being "front and centre of this
23 Inquiry". We will advise and guide those relatives as
24 they present their individual patient experiences, and
25 thereby we will seek to assist the Inquiry in 12:32
26 furthering its stated aims, identified in the Terms of
27 Reference and as summarised by you, Chair, in your
28 opening address, and repeated in terms by others in
29 their opening statements, and that is, in essence, to

1 find out what happened and how it was allowed to occur.

2
3 Can I conclude this short opening, Chair, by reflecting
4 back on the Minister for Health's statement when
5 announcing a public inquiry back in September 2020, as 12:33
6 he recorded his apologies to patients and their
7 families who were, he said: "Let down by a shocking
8 failure within the health and social care system in
9 Northern Ireland", and he said as follows:

10
11 "However, families and patients want and deserve more
12 than apologies. They want and need answers as to why
13 this happened and how it was allowed to happen. I
14 hope..." 12:34

15
16 - he said: 12:34

17
18 "...that the public inquiry that I have announced today
19 will give them those answers." 12:34

20
21 Your expectation, Chair, which you set out in your
22 written statement dated 10th November last year, is
23 that the Core Participants will: "Go beyond giving a
24 personal account of their experience of the matters
25 under investigation by the Inquiry." 12:34

26
27 You said you "expect the involvement of Core
28 Participants to further the work of the Inquiry and to
29 assist it in fulfilling its Terms of Reference."

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

Myself and Ms. Ross, with the specialist support and advice provided by our experienced solicitor team, with the overriding objective of assisting the Panel in its examination of issues, will seek to do that comprehensively, and concisely, and expeditiously, and in doing so, Chair, consistent with the aims and objectives of the Inquiry, and within its Terms of Reference, we will assist in ensuring those patients that suffered appalling abuse as a result of acknowledged shocking failures will, along with their families, finally through this process, have their voices heard, and they will indeed be front and centre of this Inquiry. Thank you.

12:35

12:36

CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much indeed, Mr. Maguire. Just one correction, if I may. Group 1 is actually, of course, those affiliated to Action for Muckamore and Group 2 is Society of Parent and Friends of Muckamore. It's the other way round.

12:36

MR. MAGUIRE: I'm obliged.

12:36

CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much indeed.

END OF SUBMISSION BY MR. MAGUIRE

CHAIRMAN: That concludes our business today. We'll look forward to hearing from Ms. Anyadike-Danes QC on Monday at ten o'clock, please, we'll be starting.

12:36

Just one bit of housekeeping. Could you please ensure

1 that if you want to use one of our four conference
2 rooms you do book it in advance with the secretary to
3 the Inquiry, partly that's because we have a limited
4 number of rooms, but also we need to know who has used
5 them for cleaning purposes for the Covid protocol. So, 12:37
6 please, just make sure you book a room before walking
7 in.

8
9 Thank you all very much indeed. We will reconvene on
10 Monday at ten o'clock. 12:37

11
12 THE INQUIRY WAS THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL MONDAY, 13TH JUNE
13 2022 AT 10:00 A.M.